

**Agricultural Trade
Liberalization in the WTO
and Its Poverty Implications**

**A Study of Rural Households
in Northern Vietnam**

Sabine Daude



PETER LANG

Europäischer Verlag der Wissenschaften

7 Summary, conclusions, policy recommendations and research implications

This last chapter summarizes the main aspects of the study and draws some conclusions. In the second section policy recommendations are derived and suggestions for further research are given.

7.1 Summary and conclusions

Vietnam experienced an extraordinary change in its economic system over the last twenty years from a centrally planned economy to a market-oriented economy in the course of a reform process known as 'Doi Moi' that started in the mid-1980s. This liberalization process not only included far-reaching domestic reforms, but also commitments made under several international agreements like ASEAN and APEC. As a result, living conditions in the country have improved substantially, but poverty is still persistent at very high levels and is unevenly distributed within the country. This is especially true for marginalized zones like the mountainous areas in Northern Vietnam, which are characterized by harsh geographic and climatic conditions, very poor infrastructure and a high ratio of ethnic minorities. The challenge for the Vietnamese government at present is to tackle these poverty problems while continuing the domestic and international reform process.

The Vietnamese economy is characterized by a continuous increase in GDP over recent years, from 11 billion USD in 1985 to three times that amount in 2002. The contribution of agriculture to GDP fell by half from 40 percent to 20 percent over the same period in favor of industry and the services sector. The country is still classified as a low-income country, however, and 75 percent of the population live in rural areas. The population is characterized by a young age structure, which corresponds to an enormous labor force and many new job-seekers entering the labor market each year. During the reform process, other macroeconomic indicators saw a marked improvement: from very high inflation rates in the 1980s, Vietnam has managed to reduce inflation to a modest 3 to 4 percent. Moreover, the country has also been able to reduce its current account deficit. Exports have increased tremendously, by over 4,700 percent, from 350 million USD in 1985 to 16.5 billion USD in 2002. Increases of similar magnitude could be observed for imports, leading to alternating trade surpluses and trade deficits. Significant remittances from Vietnamese people overseas also emerged as an important positive contribution to the current account.

In the socialist era, the main trading partners of Vietnam were the Soviet Union and other socialist countries, especially in Eastern Europe. Nowadays, its main trading partners are the ASEAN countries and other major economies of the world. Vietnam exports mainly to ASEAN countries, and there is further future potential here due to the commitments stipulated in the AFTA agreement. Other

main export markets at present are Japan and the EU and, to a lesser extent – but with further potential – the US market. Imports to Vietnam come mainly from the ASEAN countries, and especially from China. Closer inspection of products traded reveals differences between Vietnam's imports and exports. Whereas imports comprise primarily heavy industrial products like machinery, exports are more diversified. The predominant position among exports, accounting for nearly 40 percent of the total, is occupied by light industrial products from the clothing sector; 20 percent are heavy manufacturing products, but a further 20 percent are primary and processed agricultural products. The agricultural sector therefore plays an important part in the export pattern of the country.

The present economic situation in Vietnam, including its trade structure, its experiences with the reform process so far, and the continuing challenges of high poverty rates and pronounced regional differences within the country, shape the political development that lies ahead of the country. The accession negotiations to the WTO are one part of this political arena.

In order to push liberalization commitments forward, Vietnam started accession negotiations with the WTO in 1995. These are still ongoing. Following the general accession procedure, Vietnam worked hard during the fact-finding phase to make its trade regime transparent for the WTO members before starting market access negotiations with different WTO members. These bilateral negotiations are currently under way and need to be accomplished before a draft of an accession protocol can be set up. Vietnam's accession negotiations are embedded into the present WTO Doha Negotiation Round, which has failed to meet the deadlines to conclude the Round successfully by the end of 2004. As has often happened during WTO negotiations, the liberalization of the agricultural sector has proven to be one of the most difficult negotiation issues. In preparation for the WTO Ministerial Conference in Cancún, Mexico, in 2003, a proposal was put forward for further agricultural liberalization. Named the Harbinson paper, the proposal suggests further liberalization commitments in the three areas of market access, export subsidies and domestic support. Although not agreed upon, the suggestions indicate a possible outcome of further agricultural liberalization negotiations. In July 2004, a modality framework was arrived at. This raises the hope that the Round will be completed, although the final deadline has been left open and is not expected to be before the end of 2005.

Against this background, the present research study investigated the implications of possible agricultural trade liberalization based on the Harbinson suggestions, with special emphasis on Vietnam. The work examined how the income and poverty situation for rural households in Northern Vietnam could change due to price changes induced by agricultural liberalization commitments of the WTO.

Whether trade and trade liberalization contribute to development, and especially poverty reduction, is a pressing question. Global figures reviewed suggest that

during the last two decades of globalization the share of people living in poverty fell by half to nearly 20 percent in 2001. Despite population growth, the total number of poor people declined by 400 million, but these developments were solely driven by poverty reduction improvements in China. For other regions international and national inequalities even increased. These figures emphasize the need for further investigation of the link between trade and poverty, because a positive relationship does not seem to be automatic. The literature studied suggests diverse transmission channels between trade and poverty, and four broad categories can be identified: links via productivity and growth, via commodity price effects, via wage changes, and via effects on government revenues. Economic growth seems to be the key to poverty alleviation, and trade can contribute through knowledge transfers or the attraction of foreign direct investment. Moreover, trade liberalization may produce synergy effects with other reforms within a reform package, and agricultural trade plays an especially important role for the rural poor.

Within different methodological options on how to approach the trade-poverty link, a micro-macro synthesis approach was chosen. This two-step approach is a tool to examine the link between international trade liberalization policies and poverty impacts at household level. In a first step, trade liberalization scenarios were simulated with the help of a general equilibrium model. The price changes obtained through these calculations were then combined in a second step with household data in a post-simulation analysis to derive income and poverty effects.

In the first step, the thesis simulated agricultural trade liberalization based on the suggestions of the Harbinson paper for two scenarios, relating to whether or not Vietnam becomes a member of the WTO. Therefore, the two scenarios imagined were: first, agricultural liberalization in the context of the WTO where Vietnam is not a WTO member, and consequently does not have to implement this liberalization, but at the same time does not benefit from concessions granted by other WTO members. Second, the same agricultural liberalization is assumed, but this time Vietnam is a member of the WTO, which means that the country implements the agricultural liberalization commitments itself and benefits through the most-favored nation principle from more liberalized trade with the other WTO member states. The general equilibrium model used was the GTAP model, together with the GTAP database V. 6.1, using 2001 as the base year. The resulting commodity and factor price changes were then linked to information from a household survey of mountainous regions in Northern Vietnam (Son La and Bac Kan province), which also refers to the year 2001.

The results from the research work done in this study can be summarized as follows: the 247 households from the survey were classified into terciles according to consumption expenditures, and most of the households were classified in the lowest consumption tercile. The analysis showed that inclusion

of consumption from subsistence production and not only bought consumption goods better reflects the consumption situation because of the very high share of subsistence production (up to 50 percent of total consumption). Expenditures for total food consumption made up nearly 85 percent of total expenditures, which only allows for limited consumption of non-food items.

To determine earnings patterns, categories were defined, such as agricultural income, off-farm own business income, wages and salaries, and transfers. The analysis showed that, on average, agricultural income contributes up to 80 percent of total earnings, which shows the high dependency of these households on agriculture. Rice earnings dominate agricultural incomes, at over 30 percent. The second biggest source of agricultural earnings for the poorest tercile is maize, cassava and sweet potatoes, at 23 percent, whereas for the richest tercile livestock is the second biggest source of agricultural earnings at 25 percent. Earnings from wages and salaries make up 20 percent of total earnings of the richest tercile, but only 9 percent of the poorer terciles. Other earnings categories turned out to play only a minor role. By analyzing the data and determining the households' consumption and earnings patterns, important insights were obtained into the living conditions of the population in the two mountainous provinces of Northern Vietnam.

The agricultural trade liberalization scenarios that were simulated with the help of the GTAP model were based on the Harbinson suggestions for reducing export subsidies to zero and reducing import tariffs according to certain tax bands for all WTO members. The distinction between the scenarios was made by treating Vietnam as a non-WTO member in the first scenario and as a WTO member in the second scenario.

Based on the scenarios, the GTAP model gives a wide variety of results for the ten defined regions and the twelve defined economic sectors for many variables. The work examined in more detail the trade, production, price and welfare effects. Looking at different countries gives a highly diversified picture. This is driven by the fact that the initial protection structure and countries' trade relations are very different from each other, which makes it a complex undertaking to look at the worldwide results. Overall, the agricultural trade liberalization scenarios result in increased worldwide exports, but also in production shifts from which some countries gain and others countries lose. Differences emerge not only between countries, but also within a country and its different economic sectors, thus leading to counteracting effects that are not visible in the net national outcome. The general pattern that emerged was that the higher the initial tax rates, the stronger were the effects from percentage tariff reductions for single products and countries.

Effects for Vietnam were of special interest in the present research. Trade effects in the different sectors were quite heterogeneous, and positive and negative effects canceled each other out in the net total. The total effect therefore only

incompletely reflected the changes within the sectors. In simulation 1, if Vietnam is not member of the WTO and agriculture is further liberalized in the multilateral trading system, the agricultural sector in Vietnam shrinks (albeit with sectoral differences) and the manufacturing sector expands. Negative trade balance effects occurred in the agricultural sector for other crops, primary products and especially other processed food, with a decrease of -144 million USD. The other agricultural sectors were only slightly positively affected. Strong positive trade balance effects stemmed from the manufacturing and service sectors, with the two manufacturing sectors contributing over 100 million USD each to a positive trade balance, and the service sector nearly 40 million USD. Thus, net agricultural exports fell, whereas manufacturing exports increased. In sum, however, exports and imports declined by more than half of one percent, which indicates a decline in the integration of Vietnam into the world economy. Similar developments were given for the output changes.

Structural adjustment takes place, and a labor surplus occurs in the agricultural sector that can move to the manufacturing sector. This is beneficial for those people living in areas with manufacturing industries, but in the short run, rural households in less well-connected and remote areas such as Son La and Bac Kan in Northern Vietnam are adversely affected. In the post-simulation analysis it was found that, due to the consumption and earnings patterns of the households in Northern Vietnam, the cost of living goes up and earnings decline, thus leading to a net income decrease of -2 percent. Differently defined poverty lines were used in the research to assess changes in the poverty situation before and after agricultural trade liberalization. The first scenario led to an increase of 0.8 percent in extremely poor households, as measured by a Vietnamese rice poverty line. Other poverty lines, such as the GSO national poverty line or the World Bank food and total poverty lines, showed an increase in the extent of poverty of between 0.4 and 1.6 percent.

In the case of Vietnam's accession to the WTO (scenario 2) the GTAP results indicated that production increases in the agricultural sector and declines in the manufacturing sector, with labor demand going in the same direction. Prices increase across all sectors, especially in the agricultural sector. Changes in the total trade balance amounted to 24 million USD compared to simulation 1. This net increase, however, was only small compared to the figures within each sector. The strongest effect occurred in the primary products sector, where there was a positive trade balance of 150 million USD compared to -72 million USD in simulation 1. Smaller increases could be observed in all other agricultural sectors; worthy of mention are the processed rice sector, which obtains a share of 32 million USD in the trade balance, and the vegetable and fruit sector, which has a share of 21 million USD. Combining this information with the household data in the second step of the methodology, it could be seen that the cost of living falls due to the high share of subsistence production. On the other hand, earnings go up because households in Northern Vietnam obtain most of their

income from agriculture. Both cost-of-living and earnings developments lead to a rise of 3 percent in net incomes and a decline of -0.4 to -2.8 percent in poverty rates, depending on the poverty line used.

Based on the results of the study, the research questions that initiated this study can be answered and the stated hypotheses can be corroborated. This leads to the following conclusions:

The research confirms the first hypotheses that rural households in Northern Vietnam that were included in the survey are negatively affected in their poverty position through the commodity and factor price changes that are induced by agricultural trade liberalization in the WTO if Vietnam is not itself a member of the WTO. The picture is reversed if Vietnam is a member of the WTO. In the latter case, the second hypotheses is confirmed: rural households benefit from the price changes because they have positive effects on their poverty situation due to the households' consumption and earnings patterns.

It can be concluded that developing countries, including Vietnam, need to pay special attention to the trade liberalization negotiations in the multilateral trading system independent of whether or not they are members of the WTO, or whether their share in the world market is small or large. Countries are affected by the outcome of the negotiations because the outcome influences the relative competitiveness of countries within the international trading community, thus changing worldwide trade relations. Countries have to take account of developments in the international trade environment and consider them in their own domestic policies to be able to benefit from opportunities that are opening up or to mitigate negative developments that may arise. As Vietnam has a large share of its population living in rural areas, and agriculture is still the most important income source for the rural poor, the WTO agricultural trade liberalization negotiations are of special importance for the country. To analyze the linkages between agricultural trade liberalization and poverty is therefore an important task, and the outcomes of such analysis are crucial for the formulation of national policies as well as for negotiation positions in the international arena such as the WTO negotiations.

The results from the research suggest that, for rural households in Northern Vietnam, it is more beneficial if the country accedes to the WTO. However, what is good for them may be less good for other poor groups with different consumption and earnings patterns and a lesser degree of subsistence production. Results at household level regarding how price changes affect the extent of poverty are driven by the share of subsistence production and the specific consumption and earnings shares. Special attention has to be given to the role of subsistence production and how it is included in the analysis, as this greatly influences the final outcome. Careful treatment of these household characteristics is therefore necessary to derive appropriate results. Moreover, looking at poverty and regional difference it is necessary to consider ethnic

minority groups, especially those living in remote areas (Glewwe, Gragnolati, and Zaman, 2002).

In many cases, research studies examining international trade liberalization give implications for a country as a whole without exploring the impacts at household level. The present research tried to fill this gap for households in an especially disadvantaged area in Northern Vietnam. As already discussed, the challenge of poverty reduction is still a pressing issue for Vietnam, and therefore poverty impacts at household level that can arise from international and national policies were examined. The chosen micro-macro approach is a useful tool to link the international policy level with the household situation. It gives the opportunity to trace policies and developments down to the 'roots', where people are affected in their actual living conditions.

7.2 Policy recommendations and suggestions for further research

Based on the results of the study and the concluding remarks made in the previous section, the following policy recommendations can be made:

It is important for Vietnam to know the consequences that arise from liberalization developments in the WTO because, as this study showed, they influence Vietnam irrespective of whether or not the country is a WTO member. The outcome of the multilateral liberalization negotiations influences international prices, production, trade flows and the welfare situation of WTO members as well as of non-WTO members.

Closely related to this awareness-raising, is enhancing analysis capacity within Vietnam to be able to examine impacts of trade liberalization on the Vietnamese economy. Within the negotiation process of the WTO (not only during Vietnam's own accession negotiations, but also those of other accession candidates) it is important for a country to know how the different policy instruments affect the sectors of its own economy. When a country has set its priorities regarding how to develop the different sectors of the economy, and when it knows which policies have which effects on which sectors, it is possible to set the right priorities in the WTO negotiations and to look for strategic alliances. Sound economic analysis capacity in Vietnam is indispensable for the negotiators in Geneva and their close interaction is important for the negotiations.

The research showed that Vietnam's accession to the WTO, in tandem with ongoing multilateral agricultural liberalization, would result in a slight poverty reduction effect for households in Vietnam. This would not, however, be a panacea to solve the challenges Vietnam faces regarding poverty reduction. Although the country has achieved remarkable reductions in poverty over the last years of reform, high rates of poverty still exist, especially in some disadvantaged regions. It has to be borne in mind that two challenges of poverty

reduction have to be tackled simultaneously: getting people out of poverty and preventing people from falling into poverty. This is in line with Vietnamese policies that aim at decreasing inequality within the country and avoiding marginalized zones like the mountainous regions in Northern Vietnam being left behind. As the results of the calculation show, trade liberalization alone is not able to substantially reduce poverty and can not be seen in isolation. In order to become an effective tool of poverty reduction, trade liberalization has to be complemented by other measures within the framework of poverty reduction programs.

It is important that the emphasis on poverty reduction forms an integral part of all trade liberalization efforts, and especially when negotiating accession to the WTO. In view of this, it is to be recommended that liberalization policies be closely linked to the Millennium Development Goals, e.g. to eradicate extreme poverty and hunger (goal no. 1) and to develop a global partnership for development (goal no. 8), with one of the targets being to establish an open, rule-based, predictable, non-discriminatory trading and financial system (target no. 12). Reinforcing the view of poverty reduction as a cross-cutting task encompassing all policy fields may help to change the perspective within the trade reform process. Entering the WTO is doubtless motivated in part by the prospect of gaining credibility within the international community as regards the irreversibility of Vietnam's reform path, but the continuous focus on poverty reduction in the process is also indispensable. Besides setting priorities for poverty reduction, another important requirement is to develop clear indicators to ensure appropriate targeting of the poor, and a suitable monitoring system to ensure that the poverty reduction objectives set are actually met.

As the results of this work show, poverty effects on households of agricultural trade liberalization depend to a large extent on households' consumption and earnings patterns, and hence poverty effects always have a regional dimension. It is therefore recommended to conduct detailed studies to determine the poverty impact on various segments of the population. These assessments need to be region-specific in order to see how different areas are affected. The most disadvantaged regions need special attention in this process (although they may not have the political power to exert pressure on the political decision-making processes to prioritize poverty reduction programs in their regions).

Moreover, the outcome of such detailed region-specific studies on the link between trade and poverty may be used to elaborate negotiation positions for the WTO negotiations. This would facilitate identification of partners to form alliances in the WTO process, because it is only in bigger groups that small countries can attain the power position that is necessary in the negotiation process. This study, and especially the macroeconomic modeling exercise, showed that 'liberalization' comprises different components, because it is not implemented by a single policy instrument but rather by several policies. A

detailed analysis can reveal which components have which effect in which national sector and thus help with the formulation of negotiating positions. It is important for Vietnam to work out areas in which concessions can be made in the WTO process that will not counteract poverty reduction efforts within the country.

The research used three poverty lines that are common in Vietnam and that differentiate degrees of poverty. Their use is helpful in identifying trade impact on the poorest of the poor. They can then be clearly defined as the target group for any development and poverty reduction strategies.

Trade liberalization measures, especially in the agricultural sector, need to be complemented by measures for agricultural development through research and extension services in order to create better income opportunities in those sectors where the poor have their highest income shares. However, it is not only agricultural technology that matters; even more important is the infrastructural, institutional and policy setting. The question that has to be answered is to what extent do these framework conditions allow for the realization of potential gains from trade liberalization (e.g. questions of infrastructure, market information systems, integration of remote areas, promote production of higher quality products and processing, local and regional administration, export capabilities, etc.). For the agricultural sector, the crucial point for participating in trade opportunities is to analyze market potentials and help farmers to organize a corresponding supply response following the above recommendations. Sustainable agricultural systems need to be promoted that generate higher incomes and which, at the same time, are not detrimental to the environment. In mountainous regions in Northern Vietnam, where there are high rates of erosion and declining soil fertility, this is a special concern as the environment is the basis for income generation for the poor and for future generations.

While this research has addressed the link between trade liberalization and poverty via commodity price and wage changes, further studies are required to analyze in detail the impact via productivity and growth and via changes in the government budget. The question of how multilateral trade liberalization, especially in the agricultural sector, affects certain poor groups in the Vietnamese population can be further extended:

The poverty effects for rural households in mountainous regions of Northern Vietnam can be strongly divergent from effects for other poor groups in Vietnam. It is therefore recommended that similar studies be conducted for other regions within Vietnam where households have other consumption and earnings patterns, and another classification of households could be imagined (e.g. distinguishing households following gender criteria). A comparison of several regions could then be made to identify the most vulnerable sections of the population in order to design poverty reduction strategies more effectively and take these insights into account when conducting further trade liberalization

negotiations within the framework of the WTO or other international commitments.

Another interesting question relates to price transmission mechanisms in Vietnam. Due to lack of available information, this aspect has not been included in the present study, but further research in this area would be of considerable interest.

Finally, this study was limited to simulate the possible agricultural negotiation outcome of the Doha Round as outlined in the Harbison paper of March 2003. Based on the real outcome of the Doha Round, further studies could concentrate on refining the simulations of the general equilibrium model in order to capture more details of the actual outcome of the ongoing negotiations, which are expected at the earliest during the WTO Ministerial Conference in Hong Kong in December 2005. For this it is necessary to see how the July 2004 framework agreement stipulating negotiation modalities is reflected in concrete figures before those can be simulated.

8 Zusammenfassung (German summary)

Armutswirkungen auf ländliche Haushalte in Nordvietnam durch Agrarhandelsliberalisierung in der WTO

Problemstellung

Vietnam hat in den letzten zwanzig Jahren einen außergewöhnlichen Wechsel seines wirtschaftlichen Systems erlebt: im Rahmen eines Reformprozesses, der unter dem Namen ‚Doi Moi‘ bekannt wurde und Mitte der 80er Jahre begann, entwickelte sich das Land von einer zentralen Planwirtschaft zu einer Marktwirtschaft. Dieser Liberalisierungsprozess beinhaltete nicht nur weitreichende heimische Reformen, sondern auch Liberalisierungsschritte, die im Rahmen von internationalen Abkommen wie dem ASEAN und APEC Abkommen eingeleitet wurden. Durch die Reformen hat sich der Lebensstandard in Vietnam deutlich verbessert. Dennoch ist ausgeprägte Armut weiterhin stark verbreitet, die jedoch sehr ungleich über das Land verteilt ist. Insbesondere benachteiligte Regionen wie die Bergregionen im Norden Vietnams, die durch schwierige geographische und klimatische Bedingungen, schlechte Infrastruktur und einen hohen Anteil an ethnischen Minderheiten in der Bevölkerung charakterisiert sind, sind davon betroffen. Die Herausforderung für die vietnamesische Regierung besteht derzeit darin, die Armut im Lande weiter zu reduzieren und gleichzeitig den heimischen und den internationalen Reformprozess voranzutreiben.

Die Beitrittsverhandlungen Vietnams mit der Welthandelsorganisation (WTO), die 1995 begannen und noch andauern, sind ein weiterer Schritt in der Öffnung des Landes und dem Bemühen, sich in die internationale Gemeinschaft zu integrieren. Sie sind eingebunden in die derzeit laufende Doha Verhandlungsrunde der WTO. Wie schon häufiger in der Verhandlungsgeschichte der WTO haben sich wiederum Liberalisierungsschritte im Agrarbereich als einer der entscheidenden Punkte der Verhandlungsrunde herauskristallisiert. In Vorbereitung auf die WTO Ministerkonferenz in Cancún, Mexico, 2003, wurde ein Vorschlag für weitere Agrarliberalisierung in den Bereichen Marktzugang, Exportsubventionen und heimische Stützung vorgelegt: das so genannte Harbinson-Papier. Obwohl der Vorschlag nicht verabschiedet wurde, zeigt er doch einen möglichen Ausgang für die laufende Verhandlungsrunde im Agrarbereich. Im Juli 2004 wurde von der WTO nach schwierigen Verhandlungen ein Rahmenabkommen verabschiedet, welches die weiteren Vorgehensmodalitäten für die Doha-Runde feststellt. Dies lässt erwarten, dass die Runde doch noch erfolgreich abgeschlossen wird, obwohl kein Enddatum festgelegt wurde. Erwartungen gehen von einem erfolgreichen Abschluss nicht vor Ende 2005 aus.

Forschungsfrage und Zielsetzung

Vor diesem Hintergrund fragt die vorliegende Studie nach den Armutswirkungen einer möglichen Agrarhandelsliberalisierung, wie sie in dem Harbinson-Papier vorgeschlagen wurden, auf ländliche Haushalte in Nordvietnam. Dazu werden die Auswirkungen des Harbinson-Vorschlags simuliert und daraus resultierende Preisveränderungen berechnet. Anschließend wird untersucht, wie sich durch diese Preisänderungen die Einkommens- und Armutssituation für Haushalte in Nordvietnam ändert. Dabei interessiert insbesondere, inwieweit sich ein möglicher Beitritt Vietnams zur WTO positiv oder negativ auswirkt.

Methodisches Vorgehen

Um die Armutsauswirkungen der Handelsliberalisierung auf Haushalte zu untersuchen, wird als methodische Herangehensweise ein „Mikro-Makro“-Ansatz gewählt. Dabei handelt es sich um ein zweistufiges Verfahren, mit dem die Verbindung zwischen Makro- und Mikroebene hergestellt werden kann. In einem ersten Schritt werden mit Hilfe eines generellen Gleichgewichtsmodells Liberalisierungsszenarien simuliert. Die dort berechneten Preisänderungen werden in einem zweiten Analyseschritt mit Haushaltsdaten verbunden, um Einkommens- und Armutseffekte auf Haushaltsebene zu berechnen.

Im ersten Schritt simuliert die Arbeit Agrarhandelsliberalisierung, wie sie im Harbinson-Papier für die WTO Verhandlungen vorgeschlagen wird. Dabei werden Exportsubventionen vollständig eliminiert. Gleichzeitig wird ein größerer Marktzugang durch die Reduzierung von Importzöllen erreicht. Die Importzölle werden für unterschiedliche Zollbandbreiten verschieden reduziert: höhere Zölle werden stärker reduziert als niedrigere, um auf längere Sicht eine Angleichung der Zollsätze zu erreichen (nicht-linearer Ansatz). Für die Simulationen werden zwei Szenarien angenommen:

1. Agrarhandelsliberalisierung in der WTO, wobei Vietnam noch kein WTO-Mitglied ist; Vietnam setzt somit diese Liberalisierung nicht selbst um und profitiert auch nicht von der Marktoffnung der anderen WTO-Mitglieder.
2. Agrarhandelsliberalisierung in der WTO, identisch zum ersten Szenario, wobei Vietnam nun jedoch als WTO-Mitglied behandelt wird. Dies bedeutet, dass Vietnam selbst die Liberalisierung implementiert und vom Zugang zu den Märkten der übrigen WTO-Mitglieder profitiert.

Für die Simulationen wird das generelle Gleichgewichtsmodell GTAP (General Trade Analysis Project) in Verbindung mit der GTAP-Datenbasis (Basisjahr 2001) benutzt. Die Daten werden zu zehn Regionen und zwölf wirtschaftlichen Sektoren aggregiert. Das Gleichgewichtsmodell gibt eine Vielzahl von Ergebnissen für die verschiedenen Modellvariablen. Die vorliegende Arbeit untersucht insbesondere die Veränderungen im Handels-, Produktions-, Preis- und Wohlfahrtsbereich.

Im zweiten Schritt der Methodik wird für 247 Haushalte aus den Provinzen Son La und Bac Kan in Nordvietnam die Konsum- und Einkommensstruktur bestimmt. Dieser Haushaltsdatensatz bezieht sich auf das Jahr 2001. Entsprechend ihrer Konsumausgaben werden die Haushalte in Terzile unterteilt. Die Konsumstruktur zeigt, dass die Einbeziehung von Konsum aus Subsistenzwirtschaft neben dem Konsum gekaufter Güter die Situation aufgrund eines hohen Selbstversorgungsgrades von bis zu 50 Prozent besser reflektiert. Um die Einkommensstruktur zu bestimmen, werden die Kategorien Agrareinkommen (weiter unterteilt nach Einkommen aus Reisproduktion, Tierhaltung, u.a.), Einkommen aus selbständiger, nicht-landwirtschaftlicher Arbeit, Löhne und Gehälter, und Transferzahlungen definiert.

Die sich ergebenden Preisänderungen für Güter und Faktoren, die im ersten Schritt mit Hilfe des GTAP Modells berechnet wurden, werden der Konsum- und Einkommensstruktur der Haushalte Nordvietnams zugeordnet, um damit Einkommens- und Armutswirkungen für diese Haushalte zu berechnen, wie sie durch eine Agrarhandelsliberalisierung erwartet werden können.

Ergebnisse

Im ersten Simulationsszenario, - Vietnam ist nicht WTO-Mitglied während die Agrarliberalisierung im multilateralen Handelssystem weiter vorangeht -, schrumpft der vietnamesische Agrarsektor, wohingegen der Industriesektor expandiert. Die Veränderungen im Agrarsektor sind für die verschiedenen Sektoren jedoch stark unterschiedlich. Dies resultiert in sinkenden Agrarexporten und ansteigenden Industrieexporten. In der Summe sinken jedoch die Exporte und Importe Vietnams um mehr als 0,5 Prozent. Dies kennzeichnet eine sinkende Integration Vietnams in den Globalisierungsprozess und die Weltwirtschaft.

Als Folge dieser Veränderungen vollzieht sich in der vietnamesischen Wirtschaft ein struktureller Anpassungsprozess: ein Überschuss an Arbeitskräften in der Landwirtschaft wandert in den Industriesektor ab. Dies ist für jene Bevölkerungsgruppen vorteilhaft, die in Regionen mit Industriebetrieben wohnen, nicht jedoch für abgelegene, schlecht erschlossene Regionen wie Son La und Bac Kan in Nordvietnam, deren Situation sich dadurch zunächst verschlechtert.

Der zweite methodische Analyseschritt zeigt, dass aufgrund der Konsum- und Einkommensstruktur die Lebenshaltungskosten der untersuchten Haushalte durch die Preisänderungen des ersten Szenarios ansteigen und die Einkommen sinken. Dies führt zu einem Netto-Einkommensverlust von zwei Prozent. Mit Hilfe von unterschiedlich definierten Armutsgrenzen wird das Ausmaß an Armut vor und nach der Agrarliberalisierung bestimmt. Für das erste Szenario ergibt sich ein Anstieg der Zahl der extrem verarmten Haushalte um 0,8 Prozent, gemessen mit einer vietnamesischen Armutsgrenze, die nur auf Ausgaben für Reis beruht. Andere Armutsgrenzen, wie die nationale Armutsgrenze des

vietnamesischen Statistikamtes oder die Armutsgrenzen der Weltbank, verzeichnen Anstiege der Armut im Rahmen zwischen 0,4 und 1,6 Prozent.

Im Falle eines Beitritts Vietnams zur WTO - Szenario 2 - zeigen die Ergebnisse des GTAP-Modells Produktionszuwächse im vietnamesischen Agrarsektor und Rückgänge im Industriesektor. In diesem Fall wandern Arbeitskräfte vom Industrie- in den Agrarsektor ab. Preisanstiege können für alle Sektoren, insbesondere in den Agrarsektoren, beobachtet werden. In der Handelsbilanz wird ein Anstieg im Vergleich zum ersten Szenario um 24 Millionen USD beobachtet. Dieser Netto-Anstieg ist jedoch nur klein im Vergleich zu den Veränderungen innerhalb der Sektoren.

Im zweiten Schritt der Methodik ergibt sich für Szenario 2 eine Verringerung der Lebenshaltungskosten für die Haushalte aufgrund ihres hohen Selbstversorgungsgrades. Auf der anderen Seite können die Haushalte ihre Einkommen steigern, da der größte Teil aus dem Agrarsektor resultiert. Beide Entwicklungen, sowohl in den Lebenshaltungskosten als auch in den Einkommen, führen zu einer Verbesserung der Netto-Einkommenssituation um 3 Prozent. Damit verringert sich das Ausmaß an Armut, gemessen mit den verschiedenen Armutsgrenzen, zwischen 0,4 und 2,8 Prozent.

Zusammenfassend zeigt die vorliegende Arbeit, dass Haushalte in Nordvietnam in ihrer Armutssituation durch die Preisänderungen für Güter und Faktoren im Falle einer fortschreitenden Agrarhandelsliberalisierung im Rahmen der WTO, wenn Vietnam nicht selbst Mitglied dieser Organisation ist, negativ betroffen sind. Die Situation stellt sich anders dar, wenn Vietnam selbst WTO-Mitglied ist. In diesem Fall profitieren ländliche Haushalte in Nordvietnam von den durch die Agrarhandelsliberalisierung verursachten Preisänderungen aufgrund der vorherrschenden Konsum- und Einkommensstruktur der Haushalte.

Schlussfolgerungen und Handlungsempfehlungen

Aus der Arbeit ergibt sich, dass Entwicklungsländer wie Vietnam in entscheidender Weise von Handelsliberalisierungsverhandlungen der WTO betroffen sind, unabhängig davon, ob sie selbst Mitglied in der WTO sind oder nicht. Entwicklungs- wie Industrieländer werden durch die Ergebnisse dieser Verhandlungen in jedem Falle beeinflusst, da sich dadurch ihre relative Wettbewerbsfähigkeit auf dem Weltmarkt und damit auch die weltweiten Handelsbeziehungen ändern. Dabei sind die Entwicklungen im internationalen Handelsumfeld bei der Formulierung ihrer eigenen heimischen Politiken zu berücksichtigen, um so sich eröffnende Chancen wahrnehmen oder um möglichen negativen Auswirkungen rechtzeitig entgegenwirken zu können. Da in Vietnam ein hoher Bevölkerungsanteil in ländlichen Gebieten lebt und die Landwirtschaft die wichtigste Einkommensquelle für die dortige Bevölkerung darstellt, sind die Verhandlungen in der WTO über weitere Agrarhandelsliberalisierung für das Land von besonderer Bedeutung. Die

Analyse des Zusammenhangs zwischen Liberalisierung und Armut ist aus diesem Grund besonders wichtig, um die dort gewonnenen Erkenntnisse sowohl in die nationalen Politiken wie auch in die Verhandlungsstrategien für einen WTO-Beitritt einfließen lassen zu können.

Die durchgeföhrten Berechnungen zeigen, dass ein WTO-Beitritt Vietnams für Haushalte im Norden des Landes vorteilhaft wäre. Dieses Ergebnis lässt sich jedoch nicht ohne weiteres auf andere arme Bevölkerungsgruppen Vietnams übertragen, da diese möglicherweise eine andere Konsum- und Einkommensstruktur sowie einen anderen Selbstversorgungsgrad haben. Eine sorgfältige Behandlung dieser Haushaltscharakteristika ist daher entscheidend, um auch für andere Bevölkerungsgruppen den Zusammenhang zwischen Liberalisierung und Armutswandlungen herausarbeiten zu können.

Viele Studien über internationale Handelsliberalisierung liefern Ergebnisse auf der nationalen Ebene, ohne jedoch die Auswirkungen auf der regionalen oder der Haushaltsebene zu untersuchen. Diese Arbeit schließt diese Lücke und untersucht die Armutswirkungen für ein besonders marginalisiertes Gebiet in Nordvietnam. Der gewählte „Mikro-Makro“-Ansatz ermöglicht die Verbindung dieser zwei Ebenen. Somit konnten die Auswirkungen internationaler Politiken auf die konkreten Lebensumstände armer Haushalte untersucht werden.

Folgende Handlungsempfehlungen lassen sich aus der Analyse ableiten:

(1) In Vietnam sollte die Sensibilisierung für die WTO-Verhandlungen und deren Wichtigkeit für die nationale Politik weiterentwickelt werden. In engem Zusammenhang dazu steht auch die Entwicklung von vietnamesischen Analysekapazitäten, um in der Lage zu sein, Auswirkungen von Liberalisierung auf die vietnamesische Wirtschaft fundiert untersuchen zu können. Im Rahmen der Beitrittsverhandlungen Vietnams zur WTO, aber auch bei Beitrittsverhandlungen anderer Länder, ist es wichtig zu wissen, wie sich hypothetische Verhandlungsergebnisse auf die verschiedenen Sektoren der eigenen Wirtschaft auswirken. Nur so ist es einem Land möglich, eigene Verhandlungsprioritäten zu setzen und gegebenenfalls nach geeigneten Verbündeten zur Stärkung der eigenen Verhandlungsposition zu suchen. Für die vietnamesischen Unterhändler in Genf sind starke ökonomische Analysekapazitäten in Vietnam, die eng mit ihnen zusammenarbeiten, unerlässlich.

(2) Die Ergebnisse haben die armutsreduzierenden Auswirkungen eines vietnamesischen WTO-Beitritts für Haushalte in Nordvietnam aufgezeigt. Allerdings wird ebenfalls deutlich, dass ein WTO-Beitritt kein Allheilmittel zur Lösung des vietnamesischen Armutproblems sein kann. Trotz der beeindruckenden Verbesserung der Lebensverhältnisse in Vietnam während der Reformjahre bleibt Armut, insbesondere in benachteiligten Regionen, weiterhin eine der dringendsten Herausforderungen für die Regierung. Ein potentieller

WTO-Beitritt kann zur Lösung dieses Problems beitragen, es aber nicht alleine lösen.

(3) Die Armutseffekte in den Ergebnissen der Arbeit hängen stark von der Konsum- und Einkommensstruktur der untersuchten Haushalte ab und sind somit sehr regionenspezifisch. Daher sind detaillierte Studien in verschiedenen Regionen Vietnams erforderlich, um die Armutsauswirkungen durch Liberalisierung auf verschiedene Bevölkerungsgruppen einschätzen zu können. Dabei sollten benachteiligte Regionen besondere Aufmerksamkeit erfahren.

(4) Aus den Ergebnissen wird deutlich, dass Handelsliberalisierung allein Armut nicht substantiell reduzieren kann und daher nicht isoliert betrachtet werden darf. Um ein effektives Werkzeug zur Armutsrreduzierung zu sein, muss Handelsliberalisierung im Rahmen von Gesamtprogrammen durch andere Maßnahmen ergänzt werden. Im Agrarsektor sollte dies Maßnahmen in Forschung und Beratungsdiensten beinhalten, um bessere Einkommensmöglichkeiten in den Sektoren zu schaffen, aus denen arme Bevölkerungsgruppen den Großteil ihres Einkommens beziehen. Allerdings ist nicht nur die Agrartechnologie von Bedeutung, vielmehr spielen institutionelle und infrastrukturelle Rahmenbedingungen eine entscheidende Rolle. Dabei geht es um die Frage, inwieweit diese Rahmenbedingungen wie Infrastruktur und Anbindung entlegener Gebiete, Marktinformationssysteme, Verbesserung der Produktqualitäten, Verarbeitungsmöglichkeiten, lokale und regionale Verwaltungsstrukturen, Exportkapazitäten, etc., die Realisierung von Marktchancen ermöglichen. Um landwirtschaftlichen Haushalten die Möglichkeit zu eröffnen, am Handel teilzuhaben, ist es von entscheidender Bedeutung, die Marktnachfrage zu analysieren und den Haushalten zu helfen, ein entsprechendes Angebot zu produzieren. Dabei müssen nachhaltige Bewirtschaftungsformen gefördert werden, die sowohl höhere Einkommen ermöglichen, und dabei gleichzeitig natürliche Ressourcen schützen. Dieser Aspekt ist in Bergregionen Nordvietnams aufgrund hoher Erosionsraten und sinkender Bodenfruchtbarkeit von besonderer Bedeutung, da die natürlichen Ressourcen die Basis für Einkommensschaffung in der Zukunft darstellen.